

## Sanctuary Advisory Council Meeting

FINAL Key Meeting Outcomes

Friday, May 18, 2018

Santa Barbara Zoo, 500 Ninos Drive, Santa Barbara, CA

*Approved by the Sanctuary Advisory Council on July 20, 2018. This summary will be posted [online](#). Audio recordings are available upon request from [lindsay.marks@noaa.gov](mailto:lindsay.marks@noaa.gov).*

### **Administrative Business and Announcements**

Twenty-four council representatives attended the May meeting representing 16 voting seats (see Appendix 1). Public attendance included approximately 10 individuals in the morning and 4 in the afternoon. Council Chair Phyllis Grifman called the meeting to order and thanked the Santa Barbara Zoo for hosting. Michael Murray (CINMS Deputy Superintendent for Programs) introduced the Sanctuary staff and interns present at the meeting, and Lindsay Marks (CINMS Resources Protection Fellow) took role.

### ***Recognizing Incoming and Outgoing Members***

Phyllis welcomed David Villalobos, who was recently appointed as an alternate for the Santa Barbara County seat, to his first council meeting. David introduced himself and expressed enthusiasm to be a member of the council.

Following David's welcome, Phyllis announced that this would be Channel Islands National Park Superintendent Russell Galipeau's final Sanctuary Advisory Council meeting in the National Park Service (NPS) seat. Russell is retiring from the NPS after a 38 year career with the agency, including 15 years as Superintendent at Channel Islands National Park. Michael Murray reflected on his contributions and thanked him for creating a strong partnership between the Park and Sanctuary. Michael then presented Russell with a gift box from the Zoo, and a canvas-printed photo of Santa Rosa Island with a personal message to the Superintendent in gratitude for his 15 years of service to the council. Many council members also spoke up to thank Russell for his service, support and mentorship, including Commander Lushan Hannah, Michael Cohen, John Ugoretz, and Jenn Eckerle. Russell expressed his thanks for the recognition, and his appreciation of the council for how the members work together to help protect the marine environment of the Channel Islands for future generations.

### ***March 16, 2018 Draft Key Outcomes***

The council unanimously voted to approve the key outcomes from the March 16, 2018 meeting. Copies of these documents are available upon request from [lindsay.marks@noaa.gov](mailto:lindsay.marks@noaa.gov). They also will be posted on the sanctuary's [website](#).

### ***Sanctuary Superintendent's Report***

Deputy Superintendent Michael Murray began his remarks by mentioning the CINMS budget. He shared that a budget similar to the previous year has finally been approved and allocated for FY2018, and explained that most of these funds support staff and a small amount of R/V *Shearwater* operations.

In his report, Murray also mentioned upcoming water quality sampling that will take place at 18 sites within the sanctuary during the 2018 Southern California Bight Regional Monitoring Project, giving thanks to Jenn Eckerle for the support provided by the Ocean Protection Council. He also described

activities surrounding the recent visit of a small cruise ship, the M/S *Silver Explorer*, to the sanctuary and park. Russell Galipeau added that cruise ships likely constitute a growing issue in the region, and the park will need to be careful about concessions and contracts to ensure that these ships are not in competition with local operators and do not increase visitation beyond set park capacities. Murray also mentioned that an even smaller expedition vessel is considering visiting the sanctuary and park in late October, and that additional details would be shared with the council as more is learned.

### ***Council Member Brief Announcements***

Council members shared news and announcements about recent events unrelated to the meeting agenda. Audio recordings are available upon request from [lindsay.marks@noaa.gov](mailto:lindsay.marks@noaa.gov).

### **Island/Sanctuary Visitor Transport Services: Condor Express**

Sanctuary deputy superintendent Michael Murray introduced special guests Captain David Beezer and Jill Barton from Condor Express. Captain Dave shared his experiences as an operator of the whale watching vessel *Condor Express*. He described the inception and history of Sea Landing at Santa Barbara Harbor, which was started by Fred Benko in 1973 as a sport fishing, diving and sunset cruise company. However, Fred began taking an interest in whales and eventually moved his business away from fishing to focus on whale watching. He built the Condor Express in 2002, a state of the art catamaran designed to be environmentally friendly and safe for marine animals. Condor Express provides year round whale watching cruises. Captain Dave emphasized the importance of the sanctuary for the protection of the ecosystem that supports such a great abundance and diversity of wildlife upon which their business depends. He also noted that the Channel Islands Naturalist Corp adds great value to their business and enhances the experience of their passengers. He pointed to some scientists with whom Condor Express collaborates to support research, and how these researchers are able to help him identify whales via photo identification which adds to the experience of passengers. Captain Dave mentioned some recent trends he has observed in whale distribution, including an overall growth in populations (especially humpbacks) and movements to the backside of the islands that seems tied to the dynamic nature of their food sources around the channel. He also said he has noticed a rise in ecotourism, noting that many foreign visitors are well educated about the ecology of the area and hope to see specific species of whales during their cruise.

### **Non-Native Algae in Sanctuary and Park Waters: Discussion and Council Endorsement of Report**

Council member John Ugoretz from the California Department of Fish & Wildlife presented information about the invasive alga *Undaria pinnatifida*, including observations of low densities (2 individuals) during recent surveys at Catalina Island in the same location where a population (559 individuals) was discovered in 2001. He noted that, although this is an invasive species, the Catalina population does not seem to be taking over but rather has persisted at a low level for many years. John shared that *Undaria* is present in every harbor from San Diego to Monterey and he described past removal efforts at Catalina and in the Monterey Harbor, noting that these were largely unsuccessful. He also pointed out that large individuals can grow extremely rapidly on recently cleaned hulls, as has been observed on the CDFW R/V *Melanops*. This suggests vessel cleaning may be required at unrealistically frequent intervals to successfully prevent the spread of *Undaria*, but also that hull inspections conducted prior to trips to the islands could help address this challenge. John closed by saying that the draft report prepared by Roxanne Diaz presents a number of good recommendations for managing the spread of *Undaria*, and was pleased with how CDFW comments had been incorporated into the report.

Sean Hastings, Resource Protection Coordinator, introduced Roxanne Diaz, a masters student from the University of California Santa Barbara (UCSB) Bren School of Environmental Science and Management and a CINMS intern. Roxanne summarized the content of a report on management options for the invasive alga *Undaria pinnatifida* in sanctuary waters. She covered the following categories of recommendations: research, education and outreach, continued monitoring of spread, vector management,

and removal efforts. She described several targeted options within each category that CINMS could pursue, listed potential partners in these various efforts, and described case studies from other regions to control invasive *Undaria* that could inform local efforts. Roxanne closed by thanking the council for their insightful commentary on the report and inviting them to ask questions.

Following Roxanne's presentation, a conversation ensued that focused on the potential challenges to implementing some of the recommendations in the report. Concern was expressed about creating onerous and potentially expensive requirements for boaters in order to visit the sanctuary and the enforcement options that were presented. Potential partners came forward to help with education and outreach, including Conservation seat Kristen Hislop from the Environmental Defense Center, and Ventura County seat Danielle Tarr from the Channel Islands Harbor. Some questions were raised about natural controls and potential uses for human harvesting of *Undaria*. John Ugoretz shared that *Undaria* is a highly sought-after food source, known popularly as Wakame, commonly used in miso soup. He added that the distribution of invasive populations elsewhere in the world suggest it is limited on the open coast by high wave action. Another question was raised about the potential for competition between *Undaria* and another invasive algae, *Sargassum horneri*. Sea Grant Resources Protection fellow Lindsay Marks, who studies invasive algae, responded that while the relationship between these two invasive algae has not been studied explicitly, these two recent invasions are likely the result of changing ocean conditions and native ecosystems.

Deputy superintendent Michael Murray reiterated that the intention of this report is to provide a wide variety of ideas, case studies, resources and contact information to facilitate future conversations about what the sanctuary and other agencies could do to manage *Undaria* and other marine invasive species. He announced his intention to summarize the views expressed during this discussion in combination with the written feedback we have already received to ensure the report reflects the perspectives of council members.

Recreational fishing seat Captain David Bacon commented that he would like the report to emphasize potential public partnerships in addressing the issue of marine invasions, and reiterates he is in a position to help with outreach to boaters. He also asked that a statement be added to the report documenting concerns from the boating community about potential restrictions and costs that could result from clean vessel programs.

Several members stated their approval of the report as a helpful guiding document. John Ugoretz then made a motion that "the sanctuary advisory council endorse this report as a tool to seek potential options for control and monitoring of *Undaria* and other invasive species in the sanctuary." The motion was seconded. John emphasized that he supports this report because it is not prescriptive but rather presents options along with context about the feasibility of those options. Donna Schroeder, Bureau of Ocean Management (BOEM) seat, adds that the language is general enough to allow the BOEM to support the report as a guiding document.

Merit McCrea, the recreational fishing seat alternate, expressed appreciation for the report but also pointed out a lack of detail around the cost of implementing some of the recommendations. He suggested that cost-benefit analyses be done before these strategies are implemented.

Captain Bacon asked that the motion to endorse the report be amended to acknowledge that concerns raised by certain members about costs and restrictions potentially associated with some of the recommendations will be noted in the report. This amendment to the motion was seconded, and approved by a 9-4 vote with 2 seats abstaining (Appendix 1). A vote on the amended motion was then taken and passed 12-1 with 2 seats abstaining (Appendix 1).

**Public Comment Period** (#1 of 2) Chair Phyllis Grifman called for a break in the conversation about invasive algae to allow for public comment. Lee Moldaver of the Coastal Resource Center made several comments appreciating the presentation by Condor Express staff and news shared by Errin Briggs. He also acknowledged the accomplishments of retiring NPS Superintendent Russell Galipeau and sincerely thanked him for his professional service that will leave a lasting positive legacy on the park and this council. Another public comment came from someone pointing out that cruise ships could be vectors of aquatic hitch-hikers and should be considered as a potential source of funding to support something like a clean vessel pass program.

### **Shipping and Whales**

Sean Hastings, Resource Protection Coordinator for CINMS, provided updates about the Vessel Speed Reduction (VSR) program, which incentivizes commercial ships to slow down when transiting the Santa Barbara Channel region to reduce air pollution and the threat of fatal whale strikes. He shared statistics from the 2017 Vessel Speed Reduction program, which expanded to include the San Francisco Bay Area and ultimately slowed 143 ships down to 12 knots or less during the program period. Sean said that a recent awards ceremony held to honor the 11 participating companies was a success and attended by 4 congressional representatives. He also announced plans for a 2018 program, which will align with the seasonal whale advisory and use a fleet-based approach to reward companies based on the overall compliance of a company with the request that they travel at 10 knots or less through the whale advisory zones. A conversation with the council ensued about the transition from a historically dynamic whale advisory season to a fixed date and fixed area approach being used this year. Sean also shared that significant funding for the 2018 program is coming from the Santa Barbara County and Ventura County Air Quality Management districts, and discussion about other potential sources of funding for the program followed.

Madison Harris and Chester Lindley, two masters students from the UCSB Bren School of Environmental Science and Management, presented the results of a group project investigating ways to expand the VSR program and the potential for corporate partnerships in incentivizing vessel speed reduction. The students began by reviewing other incentive program case studies, interviewing shipping representatives, and conducting stakeholder analyses. They learned that best results are typically achieved when multiple stakeholders are leveraged within a program, that shipping companies are largely shielded from public influence, and shipping companies are responsive to their customers. The students then explored whether large corporations (i.e. Wal-Mart, Nike) could exercise their leverage to influence shipping companies to change their practices. Through interviews with business consultants, supply chain managers and sustainability directors at corporations, the students learned the following: most companies are not aware of the issue of whale strikes, many companies do not currently focus sustainability efforts in their supply chain, corporations adopt environmental initiatives that have clear, measurable metrics, and action is motivated by companies who have leverage (large businesses or conglomerate working groups). The students are now generating a plan for how to engage corporations in incentivizing sustainable shipping practices.

### **Review of CINMS Management Plan Implementation**

Michael Murray, CINMS Deputy Superintendent for Programs, described an internal staff review process that was conducted in the fall and winter of 2017/18 to review progress made on implementation of the sanctuary's current management plan, which was published in 2009. The internal review process, Murray explained, was designed to allow staff to review everything the plan had called for, take stock of what had been completed, sustained, or left unstarted, and to start to consider the ongoing relevance of the plan's strategies and activities. Overall, staff found that the goals, objectives and priorities of the existing management plan were generally still relevant, and management of the sanctuary could continue under the

guidance of the current plan. However, Murray explained that with a new 2018 CINMS Condition Report that is almost done, staff want to use that information as a springboard to help revise and update the management plan. Doing so, Murray noted, will help make sure the plan is up to date, suits the sanctuary's strengths, is responsive to contemporary issues, and can guide future work effectively. Murray then talked about some of the history related to how and why the current plan was built to be so ambitious, retracing some of the budget tightening history that played a role in limiting some extent of plan implementation, but that also gave rise to a more flexible and entrepreneurial approach to partnership-based management that has helped CINMS advance in many areas despite budget strain. Murray presented a series of slides on each of the eight action plans within the CINMS management plan, highlighting notable accomplishments for each, and commenting on a variety of activities that didn't work out according to plan, or that achieved success in ways not anticipated. Murray capped off the presentation by explaining to the advisory council that staff look forward to engaging them in the management plan revision process, probably starting in early 2019. He showed a general diagram that depicted a possible flowchart for the process, noting that the complexity and length of the process will largely be driven by choices made along the way regarding the scope of actions to be pursued (e.g., regulatory changes, or not). (Slides are available upon request).

**Public Comment Period (#2 of 2)** No comments.

### **Working Group Reports**

Council members shared updates on Working Groups and Subcommittee activities and plans.

- ***Chumash Community Working Group:*** no report.
- ***Research Activities Panel (RAP):*** Mark Steele shared the topics covered in the last meeting of the RAP, including the ongoing process of adding ecosystem services to the Sanctuary condition report. Sanctuary staff provided the RAP updates on a variety of research projects, including mapping soundscapes, work on deep sea corals and sponges, and upcoming available boat time.
- ***Marketing Subcommittee:*** Michael Cohen reminded the council of upcoming events that may be featured in social media, such as the Get Into Your Sanctuary campaign and photo contest. He shared some examples of recent sanctuary social media activity and encouraged council members to promote these posts when possible.
- ***Sanctuary Education Team:*** Cliff Rodriguez expressed an intention to host a working group in the fall to identify resources, generate an agenda and set outcomes for an envisioned November 2018 workshop to be focused on training various types of divers to help find endangered white abalone in the wild. The workshop would be coordinated by sanctuary staff Julie Bursek with help from the SET, and include researchers from the NOAA Southwest Fisheries Science Center working on white abalone restoration in southern California. Cliff is looking to people in this group to get involved in the working group.
- ***Recreational Fishing Working Group:*** Capt. David Bacon advertised that the meeting of Coastal Conservation Association of California will be held the following week. Topics will include enhancing inshore fish populations and creating reefs. He also announced that NOAA Fisheries released an annual report to congress, and highlighted that the number of overfished stocks are at an all-time low, and three stocks (bocaccio, rockfish and perch) are rebuilt.
- ***Commercial Fishing Working Group:*** No report; members absent during this agenda item.
- ***Conservation Working Group (CGW):*** Kristen Hislop reported on a recent meeting of the Conservation Working Group, at which a variety of marine environmental affairs and issues were discussed. This included: an ongoing invasive species outreach campaign through the MPA collaborative; two bills introduced in the State Legislature related to oil and gas infrastructure; a stalled offshore wind proposal; and a recent State Lands Commission town hall meeting that took place to discuss the decommissioning of Platform Holly and abandoned wells.

**Meeting Close Out**

- Sanctuary deputy superintendent Michael Murray closed the meeting by thanking the council members and public for attending, and thanking our hosts at the Santa Barbara Zoo.
- Upcoming advisory council public meetings are scheduled for July 20, September 21, and November 16, 2018.

**Meeting adjourned.**

**APPENDIX 1: Sanctuary Advisory Council Meeting Attendance Roster and Voting Record**  
(May 18, 2018)

<b>Name</b>	<b>Advisory Council Seat</b>	<b>Meeting Attendance</b>	<b>Vote on Amendment to Motion related to <i>Undaria</i> Report</b>	<b>Vote on Amended Endorsement of <i>Undaria</i> Report</b>
Andrea Mills	Tourism	Absent	-	-
<i>vacant</i>	Tourism - Alternate	n/a	-	-
Ben Pitterle	Non-Consumptive Recreation	Present	Y	Y
Dr. Tony Knight	Non-Consumptive Recreation - Alternate	Present	-	-
Michael Cohen	Business	Present	N	Y
Capt. Kip Louttit	Business – Alternate	Present	-	-
Kristen Hislop	Conservation	Present	-	-
Greg Helms	Conservation – Alternate	Present	-	-
Stephanie Mutz	Commercial Fishing	Present	Y	Y
John Hoadley	Commercial Fishing - Alternate	Absent	-	-
Capt. David Bacon	Recreational Fishing	Present	Y	Y
Merit McCrea	Recreational Fishing - Alternate	Present	-	-
<i>vacant</i>	Education	n/a	-	-
Cliff Rodrigues	Education – Alternate	Present	Y	Y
Dr. Robert Warner	Research	Absent	-	-
Dr. Mark Steele	Research – Alternate	Present	-	-
Phyllis Grifman	Public at Large #1	Present	Y	Y
Judy Willens	Public at Large #1 - Alternate	Present	-	-
Richard Block	Public at Large #2	Absent	-	-
Eric Kett	Public at Large #2 - Alternate	Absent	-	-
Luhui Isha Ward	Chumash Community	Absent	-	-
Alicia Cordero	Chumash Community – Alternate	Present	Y	Y
Laura McCue	NOAA Fisheries	Absent	-	-
<i>vacant</i>	NOAA Fisheries – Alternate	n/a	-	-
Russell Galipeau	National Park Service	Present	N	Y
<i>vacant</i>	National Park Service – Alternate	n/a	-	-
CDR Lushan Hannah	US Coast Guard	Present	Abstain	Abstain
LCDR Jason Brand	US Coast Guard – Alternate	Absent	-	-
Donna Schroeder	BOEM	Present	Y	Y
<i>vacant</i>	BOEM – Alternate	n/a	-	-
Walt Schobel	Dept. of Defense	Present	Abstain	Abstain
<i>vacant</i>	Dept. of Defense – Alternate	n/a	-	-
Dr. Julia Coates	CA Dept. of Fish & Wildlife	Absent	-	-
John Ugoretz	CA Dept. of Fish & Wildlife – Alternate	Present	N	N
Jenn Eckerle	CA Natural Resources Agency	Present	Y	Y
Paige Berube	CA Natural Resources Agency - Alternate	Absent	-	-
Dr. Jonna Engel	CA Coastal Commission	Absent	-	-

Jacqueline Phelps	CA Coastal Commission – Alternate	Absent	-	-
Errin Briggs	Santa Barbara County	Present	N	Y
David Villalobos	Santa Barbara County – Alternate	Present	-	-
Danielle Tarr	Ventura County	Present	Y	Y
<i>vacant</i>	Ventura County – Alternate	n/a	-	-
Chris Mobley	Channel Islands NMS [non-voting]	Absent	-	-
Mike Murray	Channel Islands NMS - Alternate [non-voting]	Present	-	-
Paul Michel	Monterey Bay NMS [non-voting]	Absent	-	-
Karen Grimmer	Monterey Bay NMS - Alternate [non-voting]	Absent	-	-
Maria Brown	Greater Farallones NMS [non-voting]	Absent	-	-
Brian Johnson	Greater Farallones NMS [non-voting]	Absent	-	-
<b>Vote totals:</b>			9 yes, 4 no	12 yes, 1 no