

CHANNEL ISLANDS NATIONAL MARINE SANCTUARY
Sanctuary Advisory Council Meeting

FINAL Key Meeting Outcomes
Friday, May 17, 2019
Santa Barbara Zoo, Santa Barbara, CA 93103

This meeting summary will be reviewed and approved by the advisory council, and then posted online at https://channelislands.noaa.gov/sac/meeting_notes.html. Additionally, audio recordings from the meeting are available upon request to pike.spector@noaa.gov.

Administrative Business and Announcements

Twenty-five council representatives attended the meeting representing 15 voting seats (see Appendix 1). Public attendance included approximately six individuals in the morning, and seven in the afternoon. Council Chair Phyllis Grifman called the meeting to order.

Recognizing outgoing members

Council Chair Grifman acknowledged the departure of US Coast Guard Member CDR Lushan Hannah and California Department of Fish and Wildlife (CDFW) member Dr. Julia Coates. She also mentioned that CDFW alternate John Ugoretz would serve as the member for that seat.

March 15, 2019 Draft Key Outcomes

The council unanimously voted to approve the key outcomes from the March 15, 2019 meeting, subject to correction of one sentence that was pointed out by Cliff Rodrigues. Copies of these documents are available upon request from pike.spector@noaa.gov. They will also be posted on the sanctuary's website.

Sanctuary Superintendent's Report

Superintendent Chris Mobley began by thanking Public at Large Member and Santa Barbara Zoo CEO Richard Block for hosting the meeting at the Zoo. He then described a NOAA leadership meeting that took place in Hawaii earlier in May, and mentioned the potential designation of a new national marine sanctuary on the East Coast: Mallows Bay-Potomac River in Maryland. Mobley also acknowledged that the budget is tight for this fiscal year.

Superintendent Mobley recognized Channel Islands Naturalists Corps Blue Whale Award recipient Dino Dal Bon, who was in attendance at the meeting. Mobley then described recent unmanned aircraft testing that occurred in the sanctuary; applications include assisting with oil spill response by mapping spills as they develop. Mobley relayed the ongoing soundscape study within the sanctuary and referenced the presentation by Dr. Peavey-Reeves at the March SAC meeting. In continuing with the report, he described an education cruise with science teachers aboard r/v *Shearwater* using a NOAA BWET grant. He then acknowledged CINMS and Channel Islands National Park presence at local Earth Day celebrations in Santa Barbara and Ventura. Mobley wrapped up with the announcement of a Vessel Speed Reduction program award ceremony he attended in the Bay Area on May 16, noting strong media presence.

Education Member Cliff Rodrigues tacked on a description of the Education cruise and reported on the issue of *Sargassum* on Mexico's east coast (Caribbean).

Council Member Brief Announcements

Council members shared news and announcements about recent and upcoming events unrelated to the meeting agenda. Audio recordings are available upon request from pike.spector@noaa.gov.

Sanctuary Condition Report: Volume 2

Ecosystem Services Assessment (slides available upon request)

Ms. Danielle Schwarzmann, an economist with the NOAA Office of National Marine Sanctuaries, gave a remote presentation on ecosystem services, explaining how an analysis of these services will be integrated into the final compilation of volumes 1 and 2 of the CINMS Condition Report. Ms. Schwarzmann noted that CINMS is the first sanctuary to incorporate an assessment of ecosystem services into a Condition Report. By integrating the human dimensions of resource use within the sanctuary, the ecosystem services assessment specifically addresses the human drivers of resource use, and how they are likely to change in the future. Los Angeles, Ventura, and Santa Barbara counties are the main focal areas for population studies; these populations are expected to steadily climb in the future. With this projected increase, as well as growing demand for fishery products from overseas markets, authors of the assessment expect there to be greater pressures on the sanctuary's natural resources. Therefore, the ecosystem services within the sanctuary are evaluated in three main categories: cultural, provisioning, and regulatory. Within each of these categories, each service provided by, or within, the sanctuary is evaluated by its economic, non-economic, and ecological indicators. These categories are then further delineated into their own subcategories, many of which are evaluated directly in the condition report (i.e. "cultural" contains sense of place, non-consumptive recreation, etc., whereas "provisioning" relates to both recreational and commercial fishing, among other actions). Each service provided by the sanctuary is evaluated by two metrics: *status* and *trend*. A key can be found in the condition report which outlines the criteria for each rating (from *poor* to *good*). Ms. Schwarzmann noted that the data sets used to analyze the ecosystem services of the sanctuary extend only to 2012, such that several of the trend delineations for predicted changes are "undetermined". However, the general status for the ecosystem services evaluated in the Condition Report is fair to good, and the general trend is stable. (Note: the final condition report is expected to be posted at channelislands.noaa.gov in mid-July, 2019).

Chumash Ecosystem Services Assessment

Ms. Alicia Cordero, First Nations Program Officer for the Wishtoyo Foundation and Chumash Community seat representative, provided an overview of an independently-authored Chumash ecosystem services assessment. Ms. Cordero began her oral presentation by stating that, while ecosystem services are a major concern to the Chumash community, it is not possible to speak on behalf of that broad community out of concern for taking away others' voices. However, with guidance and strong support from the Chumash Women's Elder Council (CWEC), Ms. Cordero was able to pull together a report that reflects many contributors. Of the many challenges facing the task of writing up a Chumash ecosystem services assessment, two big factors are the use of internal language, which does not translate easily outside of the community, and the reality of a dispersed community that does not gather centrally. Ms. Cordero explained that the authors borrowed some academic language to use as a bridge between "settler colonist/modern colonial" perspectives and Traditional Ecological Knowledge.

Further, Ms. Cordero explained that the CWEC expressed deep concern that any economic models would fall short and undervalue the relationship the Chumash people have with the Channel Islands and its surrounding waters. The loss of access to traditional homeland islands has had resounding impacts to the Chumash people; it is hard to calculate empirically, but the economics are clear. After many generations of economic disadvantages, many Chumash cannot access their island origin sites based on socioeconomic hardships. Therefore, the Chumash assessment of ecosystem services also incorporates a loss of access to the ecosystems themselves. This also serves as an example of report disparities; consumption in a modern context does not align with the Chumash relationship with natural resources. Traditional Chumash practices teach that the consumption of natural resources is regenerative, and any take should benefit the system. Ms. Cordero finished by saying that the denied access to Chumash people of their island heritage is viewed as a loss of knowledge, but that there are many Traditional Ecological Knowledge resources available in the report.

Ms. Cordero's presentation concluded with a question and answer session; several council members expressed strong appreciation for the Chumash community's ecosystem services assessment. Some council members, especially those that are members of the Channel Islands Naturalist Corps, were very eager to incorporate some of the Chumash perspectives into their outreach and education materials. To address audience questions, Deputy Superintendent Michael Murray noted that the Chumash's report will be published with the CINMS Condition Report, which will soon be made publicly accessible online (expected at channelislands.noaa.gov in mid-July, 2019). Finally, Cultural Resources and Education Coordinator for the Wishtoyo Foundation Mia Lopez noted that the Chumash report only speaks for the Chumash authors, and that it is important to note that there are other First Nations peoples, in places where other national marine sanctuaries are found, whose voices are still unheard.

Response Section (slides available upon request)

Deputy Superintendent Michael Murray gave a brief presentation on the Response Section within Volume 2 of the Condition Report. This section reviews a list of pressures on resources in the sanctuary, and summarizes what the sanctuary has been doing to address these issues over the last 10+ years. Murray acknowledged that addressing drivers and pressures requires a long-term commitment using a multidisciplinary, partnership-based approach (including the advisory council). Murray went on to note that not every human interaction in the sanctuary is a problem that needs to be "fixed". Further, the Response Section is not a prescription for future management action. Rather, it is more of a look-back on previous management actions. Murray stressed that recurring assessments of adaptive actions are part of the management cycle. Of the many topics listed in the Response Section, Murray briefly highlighted two main areas of interest, vessel traffic and fishing (commercial and recreational), and how CINMS has worked with partner agencies and institutions to understand and mitigate impacts to sanctuary resources (e.g., whale ship strike work) and to sustain healthy conditions for fishing and protection of biodiversity.

Public Comment Period (#1 of 2)

A member of the general public thanked Ms. Cordero for a very inspiring report, and commented on the recent gray whale strandings along the West Coast.

Guest Presentation: Southern California Coastal Ocean Observing System (slides available upon request)

Ms. Megan Hepner, Southern California Coastal Ocean Observing System (SCOOS) Program Coordinator, shared information about new projects, data availability, and tools from SCCOOS. Ms. Hepner began by introducing SCCOOS as a consortium of relevant stakeholders and users with an executive steering committee made up of many principle investigators from several focus areas. SCCOOS, based at the Scripps Institute of Oceanography, is part of the U.S. based Integrated Ocean Observing System (IOOS) and is one of 11 national observing systems. SCCOOS itself is a science-based decision support system that provides scientific data and information necessary to address coastal issues with a variety of platforms. Ms. Hepner provided an overview of the SCCOOS updated webpage, which has examples of the technologies used to gather the data that SCCOOS disseminates. Of the many programs that SCCOOS supports, Ms. Hepner touched on those she felt most relevant to the advisory council's interests: harmful algal blooms, ocean acidification, ocean current detection, and sea surface temperature mapping. Ms. Hepner also noted that SCCOOS provides monthly reports for the California harmful algal bloom bulletin, and also informs the California Department of Public Health and Stranding Rescues Centers.

The counsel had general questions for Ms. Hepner, mostly about the nuances of SCCOOS's products, all of which are available online at no cost (<http://sccoos.org/>). Notably, several council members, including Vice Chair and business seat member Michael Cohen, mentioned that they personally use SCCOOS's models to help inform their business practices. Council member Captain Kip Louttit noted that pilots in the Ports of Los Angeles and Long Beach use SCCOOS's data to help with anchoring and port access decision calls.

Guest Presentation: Basking Sharks (slides available upon request)

Dr. Heidi Dewar of the NOAA's National Marine Fisheries Service Southwest Fisheries Science Center (SWFSC) gave a remote presentation on the recent presence of basking sharks in the Santa Barbara Channel. Basking sharks, the second largest shark after whale sharks, were once present in great numbers in the channel and along the north American west coast, but bycatch from former commercial fishing activities, culling efforts, and ship strikes in the 20th century contributed to reducing their numbers. In an effort to study these transient filter feeders, the SWFSC and researchers from CINMS undertook a collaborative tagging effort in the Santa Barbara Channel in April 2019. Dr. Dewar, project lead, described our current understanding of basking shark ecology and movement, and detailed the invaluable data gathered by these tags.

In response to a question about the recent increase in sightings in the Channel and around the islands, Dr. Dewar noted that this might be a sign of recovery for the north Pacific population, but that she cannot be sure at this point. Regardless, the Santa Barbara Channel is good basking shark habitat based on the channel's bathymetry and the large aggregations of copepods (basking shark's main prey). Dr. Dewar concluded by saying that a recently published web story [on the ONMS website] contains important recommendations and guidelines for viewing the sharks and reporting sightings (online here:

<https://sanctuaries.noaa.gov/news/may19/basking-shark-tagging-channel-islands-national-marine-sanctuary.html>).

Sanctuary Resource Protection Updates (slides available upon request)

CINMS Resource Protection Coordinator Sean Hastings provided a brief update on recent developments concerning whale protection and non-native algae. Mr. Hastings began by mentioning that the Vessel Speed Reduction program video, made by Earth Media Labs, that recently won the "Sylvia Earle Ocean Award" and will be showcased at an upcoming award

ceremony. The video, titled, “Protecting Blue Whales and Blue Skies”, is available on Vimeo (<https://vimeo.com/204713174>) and YouTube (<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=ryrM-PpA2wg>). This video is based on the early results and potential of the VSR program in coordination with Air Pollution Control Districts in Southern California and the Bay Area, along with the other California sanctuaries (MBNMS, GFNMS and CBNMS). Mr. Hastings noted that there has been reasonably good compliance with the *voluntary* VSR program in the Bay Area, and that is likely to do with a smaller compliance zone and fixed dates for the program. Mr. Hastings went on to mention that the whale advisory zone in the Santa Barbara Channel has been expanded, and that vessels are requested to proceed with caution and slow down to 10 knots or less. The changes are an effort to harmonize the voluntary and incentive programs both temporally (i.e. across seasons) and spatially (on nautical charts). Mr. Hastings mentioned that the aerial surveys conducted by CINMS suggest that there are more gray whales in offshore shipping lanes, rather than hugging the mainland coast in the Bight as historically expected.

Switching gears, Mr. Hastings described a successful invasive algae workshop recently held by CINMS staff at the Santa Barbara Harbor with local boat hull cleaners. Mr. Hastings also mentioned recent reports of *Undaria* at the Goleta and Carpentaria Piers, as well as current Sea Grant fellow Pike Spector’s discovery of *Undaria* at Prisoners Harbor, Santa Cruz Island.

Public Comment Period (#2 of 2)

None provided.

Working Group Reports

Council members shared updates on Working Groups and Subcommittee activities and plans

- *Chumash Community Working Group*. No report.
- *Research Activities Panel*. No report.
- *Marketing Subcommittee*. Council Vice Chair and Business seat member Michael Cohen gave an update on CINMS recent social media posts, “likes” and “shares” on Facebook and Twitter. Mr. Cohen expressed a desire for council members to continue to “like” and “share” CINMS Facebook and Twitter posts whenever possible.
- *Sanctuary Education Team*. Education seat member Cliff Rodrigues mentioned that current Sea Grant fellow Pike Spector is helping with planning for an upcoming White Abalone Workshop that will engage divers in the search for this endangered species. The workshop is tentatively targeted for early 2020.
- *Recreational Fishing Working Group*. Recreational Fishing seat member Captain David Bacon expressed his support for reef mitigation procedures happening in Palos Verdes.
- *Commercial Fishing Working Group*. On behalf of Commercial Fishing Member Stephanie Mutz, Deputy Superintendent Murray expressed appreciation for the council’s high priority interest in education about fishing, as expressed by through the Topics of Interest worksheets that members recently submitted. Mr. Cohen added that a new tourism promotion video from the Visit Santa Barbara organization contains some segments featuring Commercial Fishing seat member Stephanie Mutz at her urchin stand at the Santa Barbara harbor Saturday fish market. The council viewed the video (online here: <https://youtu.be/LmCcz8HWFvM>).
- *Conservation Working Group*. Conservation Member Kristen Hislop gave an update on the Santa Barbara Channel Marine Protected Area Collaborative’s recent acquisition of a Trident® ROV from Sofar as part of the S.E.E. Initiative. Ms. Hislop went on to mention that state

Senate Bill 69, which would provide funding for the VSR program, passed through the California Senate Appropriations Committee and has moved to the Senate floor for the final vote. Finally, Ms. Hislop addressed the recent uptick in gray whale stranding reports along the west coast. This is likely due to malnutrition and ship strikes because the whales are spending more time in shipping areas looking for food.

Meeting Close Out

- Vice Chair Michael Cohen closed the meeting out, thanking the staff of the Santa Barbara Zoo for accommodating the meeting.
- Upcoming advisory council public meetings are scheduled for July 19th, 2019 at the Museum of Ventura County, and September 20th at the Santa Barbara Zoo.

Meeting adjourned

APPENDIX 1: Sanctuary Advisory Council Meeting Attendance Roster, May 17, 2019

	Advisory Council Seat	Attendance
Andrea Mills	Tourism	Present
Morgan Coffey	Tourism - Alternate	Present
Ben Pitterle	Non-Consumptive Recreation	Present
Dr. Tony Knight	Non-Consumptive Recreation - Alternate	Absent
Michael Cohen	Business	Present
Capt. Kip Louttit	Business - Alternate	Present
Kristen Hislop	Conservation	Present
Greg Helms	Conservation - Alternate	Present
Stephanie Mutz	Commercial Fishing	Present
John Hoadley	Commercial Fishing - Alternate	Absent
Capt. David Bacon	Recreational Fishing	Present
Merit McCrea	Recreational Fishing - Alternate	Absent
Cliff Rodrigues	Education	Present
<vacant>	Education - Alternate	
Dr. Robert Warner	Research	Absent
Dr. Mark Steele	Research - Alternate	Absent
Phyllis Grifman	Public at Large #1	Present
Judy Willens	Public at Large #1 - Alternate	Present
Richard Block	Public at Large #2	Present
Mary Byrd	Public at Large #2 - Alternate	Present
Luhui Isha Waiya	Chumash Community	Absent
Alicia Cordero	Chumash Community - Alternate	Present
Laura McCue	NOAA Fisheries	Absent
<vacant>	NOAA Fisheries - Alternate	
<vacant>	National Park Service	Absent
Ken Convery	National Park Service - Alternate	Present
CDR Lushan Hannah	US Coast Guard	Absent
CDR Jason Brand	US Coast Guard - Alternate	Absent
Donna Schroeder	BOEM	Absent
Jeremy Potter	BOEM - Alternate	Absent
Walt Schobel	Dept. of Defense	Present
Greg Sanders	Dept. of Defense - Alternate	Present
John Ugoretz	CA Dept. of Fish & Wildlife	Absent
<vacant>	CA Dept. of Fish & Wildlife - Alternate	
Jennifer Eckerle	CA Natural Resources Agency	Absent
Paige Berube	CA Natural Resources Agency – Alternate	Present
Dr. Jonna Engel	CA Coastal Commission	Present
Jacqueline Phelps	CA Coastal Commission - Alternate	Present
Errin Briggs	Santa Barbara County	Present
David Villalobos	Santa Barbara County - Alternate	Present
Danielle Tarr	Ventura County	Absent
Mark Sandoval	Ventura County - Alternate	Present
Chris Mobley	Channel Islands NMS [non-voting]	Present
Mike Murray	Channel Islands NMS - Alternate [non-voting]	Present
Paul Michel	Monterey Bay NMS [non-voting]	Absent
Karen Grimmer	Monterey Bay NMS - Alternate [non-voting]	Absent
Maria Brown	Greater Farallones NMS [non-voting]	Absent
Brian Johnson	Greater Farallones NMS - Alternate [non-voting]	Absent